|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Journal Name: | [**Journal of Advances in Biology & Biotechnology**](https://journaljabb.com/index.php/JABB) |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_JABB\_139865** |
| Title of the Manuscript: | **Effect of Growing Media on Vegetative Growth Parameters of Broccoli (Brassica oleracea L. var. italica) under Soilless Cultivation"** |
| Type of the Article |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PART 1: Comments** | | |
|  | **Reviewer’s comment**  **Artificial Intelligence (AI) generated or assisted review comments are strictly prohibited during peer review.** | **Author’s Feedback** (It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | **This manuscript presents significant findings on the optimization of growing media for broccoli cultivation under soilless conditions. It demonstrates how combinations of vermicompost, cocopeat, and perlite can enhance vegetative growth parameters such as plant height, leaf length, leaf width, number of leaves, and plant spread diameter. These results contribute valuable knowledge to sustainable agriculture practices, particularly in controlled environments like polyhouses. The study provides practical insights for researchers, farmers, and policymakers aiming to improve crop productivity through efficient soilless**  **culture techniques.** |  |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?**  **(If not please suggest an alternative title)** | **Yes, the title “Effect of Growing Media on Vegetative Growth Parameters of Broccoli (Brassica oleracea L. var. italica) under Soilless Cultivation” is appropriate and clearly reflects the content of the manuscript.**  **Alternative Suggestion (if needed):**  **"Optimization of Growing Media Composition for Enhanced Vegetative Growth of Broccoli (Brassica oleracea L. var. italica) in Soilless Culture"** |  |
| **Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.** | **The abstract covers the main objectives, methods, results, and conclusion of the study. However, it requires language correction and formatting improvements.**  **Suggestions:**  **Improve grammar, sentence structure, and academic tone.**  **Clarify abbreviations (e.g., DAT – Days After Transplanting) when first mentioned. Include brief statistical significance if available (e.g., p-values or comparisons).**  **Ensure consistency in terminology and avoid repetition.** |  |
| **Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.** | Yes, the manuscript is scientifically sound. The experimental design follows a proper Randomized Block Design (RBD) with adequate replication. The methodology is clearly described, and the results are supported by statistical analysis. Interpretations are based on logical reasoning and relevant literature. The use of organic and  inorganic growing media and their combinations is well justified in the context of soilless culture. |  |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention**  **them in the review form.** | The references are sufficient and include primary sources from 2013 to 2023. However, some could be updated with more recent studies. |  |
| **Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?** | The English language used in the manuscript needs improvement, especially in terms of grammar, sentence  structure, and clarity. Several sentences are incomplete or ambiguous. It is strongly recommended that the manuscript undergo professional proofreading by a native English speaker before final publication. |  |
| **Optional/General** comments | **The research is relevant to current trends in soilless agriculture and contributes practical knowledge for optimizing broccoli growth in controlled environments. The experimental approach is solid, and the results are promising. However, improving the language and formatting will significantly enhance the readability and impact of the paper.** |  |

PART 2:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Reviewer’s comment** | **Author’s Feedback** (It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
| **Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?** | *(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in detail)*  No, The authors declare that the research did not involve human participants, animals, or private data. Therefore, no specific ethical approval was required. |  |

**Reviewer details:**

**Bayu Fajar Susanto, Universitas Islam Indragiri, Indonesia**