|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Journal Name: | [**Asian Journal of Education and Social Studies**](https://journalajess.com/index.php/AJESS) |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_AJESS\_139448** |
| Title of the Manuscript: | **Spirituality and Mental Well-being: Designing a Holistic Educational Framework for Psycho-spiritual Resilience** |
| Type of the Article | **Original Research Article** |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PART 1: Comments** | | |
|  | **Reviewer’s comment**  **Artificial Intelligence (AI) generated or assisted review comments are strictly prohibited during peer review.** | **Author’s Feedback** (It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | **This manuscript makes a significant contribution to the scientific and educational communities by articulating a comprehensive and interdisciplinary framework that situates spirituality as a legitimate and empirically grounded dimension of mental well-being. Its primary academic innovation lies in the formulation of the Holistic Resilience Model (HRM), which integrates four interrelated constructs— Spiritual Anchoring, Emotional Regulation, Communal Belonging, and Cognitive Reframing—as a multidimensional approach to psycho-spiritual resilience. This model not only synthesizes insights from diverse spiritual traditions (Vedanta, Buddhist mindfulness, Christian contemplation, and Sufi mysticism) with psychological theories (James, Jung, Maslow), but also aligns them with contemporary neurobiological research and educational imperatives. The primary purpose of this study is to explore and articulate the relationship between spirituality and mental well-being through both theoretical synthesis and qualitative insight, with the ultimate aim of informing educational and therapeutic practices.**  **Specifically, the study seeks to:**   1. **examine how diverse spiritual traditions and psychological theories conceptualize resilience and emotional balance;** 2. **identify the core psycho-spiritual dimensions that contribute to well-being; and** 3. **propose a structured, culturally adaptable model (the Holistic Resilience Model, HRM) that can be implemented in educational and clinical settings.**   **Methodologically, the research adopts an interdisciplinary literature-based inquiry supported by hermeneutic and phenomenological approaches. Drawing upon classical and contemporary sources in psychology, religious studies, and neuroscience, the study constructs an integrative theoretical framework. In addition, the article includes composite qualitative vignettes—constructed from recurrent patterns in empirical studies and practitioner accounts—to illustrate how spiritual practices function in lived**  **experience. These vignettes serve as heuristic devices to validate and contextualize the proposed model’s relevance to real-life educational and therapeutic contexts.** | This manuscript makes a significant contribution to the scientific and educational communities by proposing an empirically grounded and interdisciplinary framework that situates spirituality as a vital dimension of mental well-being. The originality lies in the conceptualization of the **Holistic Resilience Model (HRM)**, which integrates insights from spiritual traditions (e.g., Vedanta, Sufi mysticism, Christian contemplation, and Buddhist mindfulness), psychological theories (James, Jung, Maslow), and contemporary neuroscientific research. By highlighting the psycho-spiritual dimensions of resilience—Spiritual Anchoring, Emotional Regulation, Communal Belonging, and Cognitive Reframing—this model offers a culturally adaptable and pedagogically relevant schema that addresses current mental health challenges in education. The study serves both theoretical development and applied practice in psycho-social interventions and holistic education. |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?**  **(If not please suggest an alternative title)** | **The original title is consistent with the content of the manuscript; however, an alternative title such as 'A Holistic Resilience Model: Integrating Spirituality into Mental Well-being and Education' may also be appropriate. The final decision is left to the discretion of the author.** | Thank you for the thoughtful suggestion. I appreciate the proposed alternative title, *“A Holistic Resilience Model: Integrating Spirituality into Mental Well-being and Education.”* However, I would prefer to retain the current title, *“Spirituality and Mental Well-being: Designing a Holistic Educational Framework for Psycho-spiritual Resilience,”* as it aligns more precisely with the conceptual scope and thematic emphasis of the paper. |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.** | **The abstract provides a broad overview of the manuscript’s thematic focus on the connection between spirituality and mental well-being, referencing a wide range of philosophical traditions and psychological theories. It also introduces the Holistic Resilience Model (HRM) and briefly outlines its core components. Moreover, it points to the practical relevance of the model for educational and therapeutic contexts and links it to global frameworks such as the WHO and SDG goals.**  **However, while the abstract is intellectually rich and thematically inclusive, it could benefit from greater clarity, structural precision, and alignment with academic conventions. Key elements such as the research objectives, methodology, and specific contributions of the study are not clearly distinguished. The use of abstract philosophical language and metaphor e.g., "collage of interpretive reflections" may reduce immediate clarity for readers seeking a succinct summary of the study’s purpose, method, and findings.** | I appreciate the recommendation to enhance the clarity and structure of the abstract. I have revised it to improve its academic precision, clearly articulating the study’s objectives, methodology, and core contribution. Metaphorical expressions such as “collage of interpretive reflections” have been removed to ensure succinctness and clarity for a wider readership. |
| **Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.** | **The manuscript is scientifically sound in its conceptual design, interdisciplinary integration, and theoretical grounding. It presents a well-supported argument for the relevance of spirituality in mental health and education, drawing upon established psychological theories, William James, Carl Jung, Abraham Maslow), spiritual traditions , such as Vedanta, Buddhism, Christian contemplation, Sufism, and relevant empirical research in neuroscience and psychotherapy. The proposed Holistic Resilience Model (HRM) is logically constructed, with its four interrelated dimensions clearly defined and supported by both theoretical literature and qualitative vignettes.**  **While the study does not employ empirical data collection in the conventional quantitative sense, its use of composite qualitative reflections based on existing research is methodologically appropriate for its**  **exploratory and conceptual aims. Furthermore, the integration of diverse academic fields enhances the manuscript’s originality and relevance.** | Thank you for acknowledging the conceptual soundness and interdisciplinary rigor of the manuscript. I appreciate your recognition of the methodological relevance of composite qualitative vignettes as reflective illustrations grounded in real-world patterns and literature. These have been retained and slightly refined to enhance thematic clarity and flow. |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.** | **The manuscript includes a robust and interdisciplinary range of references, drawing from classic psychological theorists e.g., James, Jung, Maslow, spiritual traditions, and contemporary empirical literature in the fields of psychology, education, and neuroscience. Many citations are appropriately foundational e.g., Frankl, Pargament, Koenig, and recent studies—such as Çınaroğlu (2024) and Singh (2025)—demonstrate efforts to incorporate up-to-date scholarship. Aside from the four references cited— Singh (2025), World Health Organization (2022), Çınaroğlu (2024), and Young & Cashwell (2020)—the majority of the sources used in this manuscript were published more than ten or even twenty years ago.**  **Suggested references as below:**   1. Angie Cucchi , M Walid Qoronfleh(2025), Cultural perspective on religion, spirituality and mental health. Front. Psychol., 02 April 2025, Sec. Cultural Psychology, Volume 16 - 2025 | <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2025.1568861>.   Over the past decade, spirituality and culture have gained recognition in mental health, but integration often lacks depth. Many practices adopt spiritual elements without preserving their ontological context. This paper explores the cultural-spiritual dimensions of mental health from an anti-colonialist perspective.   1. Giancarlo Lucchetti, Harold G Koenig, Alessandra Lamas Granero Lucchetti(2021). Spirituality, religiousness, and mental health: A review of the current scientific evidence, September 2021World Journal of Clinical Cases 9(26):7620-7631 DOI:10.12998/wjcc.v9.i26.7620   Spirituality and religiousness (S/R) are increasingly linked to mental health, especially in areas | Thank you for the valuable references. I have now incorporated the following into the revised manuscript to strengthen the recency and empirical relevance of the literature review:   * Cucchi & Qoronfleh (2025) – Cultural-spiritual intersections in mental health from a decolonial lens * Lucchetti et al. (2021) – Systematic review on spirituality and mental health outcomes * Rosmarin & Koenig (2020) – Updated empirical synthesis across disorders * Relevant UNESCO (2022) and Pew Research (2021, 2022) reports—cited to reinforce educational and global relevance of spirituality   All citations have been integrated where applicable, and full references have been added to the reference list. |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | like depression, suicide, and substance use.  This article reviews current evidence, explores explanatory mechanisms, and discusses S/R- based interventions.It calls for further research and encourages clinicians to include S/R in holistic, patient-centered care.   1. Rosmarin, D. H., & Koenig, H. G. (2020). *Handbook of Spirituality, Religion, and Mental Health* (2nd ed.). Academic Press. Paperback ISBN: 9780128167663. eBook ISBN: 9780128167670   Spiritual and religious factors are closely linked to mental health, both positively and negatively. The second edition of the handbook offers fully updated research on how, why, and for whom these influences occur. It covers eight mental disorder categories and broader aspects of emotional and behavioral health.   1. Pew Research Center reports or UNESCO studies on spirituality in global education systems (2020–2023) may also provide useful empirical grounding. Pew Research Center has conducted extensive surveys on spirituality in the US and globally, exploring beliefs, practices, and their intersection with religious and non-religious identities. UNESCO focuses on education for sustainable development, which can incorporate spiritual and ethical dimensions. |  |
| **Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?** | **The overall language and English quality of the article is generally appropriate for scholarly communication. The manuscript demonstrates a strong command of academic vocabulary and effectively integrates complex interdisciplinary ideas. The tone is formal and consistent, which aligns well with academic standards.**  **overly abstract or metaphorical expressions, such as “collage of interpretive reflections” that may reduce clarity for some readers; a few minor grammatical inconsistencies and syntactic complexity that could benefit from light editing for fluency and readability.**  **Recommendation:**  **A careful round of professional language editing—focusing on sentence clarity, grammar, and conciseness—would enhance the manuscript’s overall accessibility and ensure optimal suitability for international academic publication.** | I am grateful for your detailed language suggestions. I have carefully revised the manuscript for clarity, fluency, and grammatical precision. Ambiguous metaphors and syntactically dense constructions have been simplified to improve readability and academic accessibility, while retaining the scholarly tone and depth of discussion. A final round of language editing has been completed to meet international publication standards. |
| **Optional/General** comments | **The paper successfully bridges spiritual traditions with modern psychological and educational frameworks. It is commendable in its ethical sensitivity and non-dogmatic stance. The inclusion of qualitative vignettes adds interpretive depth and illustrates real-world relevance. However, some sections would benefit from linguistic refinement for improved clarity and flow. The literature base could be strengthened with more recent empirical studies. Overall, the manuscript demonstrates originality,**  **scholarly rigor, and practical significance. With minor revisions, it holds strong potential for publication.** | I truly appreciate your encouraging remarks on the paper’s originality, ethical sensitivity, and conceptual innovation. Your feedback has been invaluable in refining the manuscript, particularly in strengthening its clarity and literature base. I am confident that the revised version reflects the scholarly and practical potential envisioned by your review. |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PART 2:** | | |
|  | **Reviewer’s comment** | **Author’s Feedback** (It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
| **Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?** | *(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)* |  |