# Review Form 3

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Journal Name: | **International Journal of Environment and Climate Change** |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_IJECC\_137297** |
| Title of the Manuscript: | **RISK ASSESSMENT OF CONSUMPTION OF PAH-CONTAMINATED PAPYROCRANUS AFER FROM BANEGBE RIVER** |
| Type of the Article | **Original Research Article** |

**PART 1: Comments**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Reviewer’s comment**  **Artificial Intelligence (AI) generated or assisted review comments are strictly prohibited during peer review.** | **Author’s Feedback** (It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | This manuscript is quite interesting and important to do, at least to provide information to the public to be aware of the potential for PAH pollution. For the government, it is necessary to provide education to every citizen to be careful in consuming fish or the like that are obtained from rivers, especially if the river basin has industrial activities, which have the potential for sources and disposal of hazardous and toxic waste such as PAH. Sometimes it is difficult to determine that a health disorder experienced by humans cannot be immediately attributed to the pollution that occurs, because pollutant materials such as PAH, usually do not have a direct impact and also do not occur in a short time, but rather occur chronically, which sometimes starts from metabolic disorders. This manuscript is quite interesting because it can provide an estimate of health disorders or medical hazards from PAH pollution that occurs |  |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?**  **(If not please suggest an alternative title)** | The proposed title is quite interesting and relatively appropriate to the contents of the manuscript, although it is acknowledged that the author does not clearly describe the health risks of consuming Papyrocranus fish from the Banegbe River. For details, see the reviewer's comments on the manuscript, attached |  |
| **Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.** | In the abstract, there needs to be a revision of the addition and deletion of sentences. For details, see the reviewer's review/comments on the manuscript. |  |
| **Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.** | Scientifically, this manuscript is sufficient and can be considered for publication, after the manuscript is revised at least according to the reviewer's suggestions, but if the editor has other arguments, please do so. Reviewer comments on some parts of the manuscript are available. Please see |  |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.** | References are sufficient, but if possible there are articles that the author can consider referring to complete this manuscript, according to the following link:   1. **https://doi.org/10.3390/toxics10060301** 2. **https://doi.org/10.3390/molecules26226851** |  |
| **Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?** | I don't have a good capacity to judge the English of this manuscript. Maybe proofreading is needed. |  |
| **Optional/General** comments | There are several parts of this manuscript that need to be described in more depth, hopefully with the additional description it can improve the quality of this manuscript and its potential for high citations if the editor of this journal decides to approve this manuscript for publication. Of course after major revisions. |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PART 2:** | | |
|  | **Reviewer’s comment** | **Author’s comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?** | *(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)* |  |

**Reviewer details:**

**Ismail Marzuki, Fajar University, Indonesia**