|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | |
| Journal Name: | [**Asian Journal of Agricultural Extension, Economics & Sociology**](https://journalajaees.com/index.php/AJAEES) |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_AJAEES\_134810** |
| Title of the Manuscript: | **FROM LOCAL THREADS TO THE FORMATION OF ILOCANO IDENTITY: THE SOCIO-CULTURAL RELEVANCE OF ABEL ILOCOS OF VIGAN CITY** |
| Type of the Article | **Original Research Article** |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| PART 1: Comments | | |
|  | Reviewer’s comment **Artificial Intelligence (AI) generated or assisted review comments are strictly prohibited during peer review.** | Author’s Feedback *(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this** | This manuscript offers valuable ethnographic insights into the intersection of traditional craftsmanship and cultural identity, highlighting the intricate role of Abel Vigan weaving in shaping and preserving Ilocano socio-cultural values. By documenting the symbolic language of weaving patterns and the lived experiences of local artisans, it contributes to the broader discourse on intangible cultural heritage and sustainable preservation practices. Its emphasis on community involvement and governmental support provides a model for cultural sustainability that can inform similar efforts globally. The study enriches academic discussions in fields such as anthropology, cultural studies, and heritage conservation by presenting a localized yet universally relevant exploration of tradition, identity, and resilience. | The study contributes to our understandings on human experiences, perspectives, and social dynamics that are reflected through symbolisms and material culture. This research also contributes to the development of theories that are more culturally sensitive and universally applicable, as it serves as tools for understanding the complexities of our human social life and cultural diversity. And most importantly, it contributes to the growing body of scholarship on the role of material culture in shaping social identities. My study also documents and preserves local Abel Ilocos knowledge, skills, and traditions, crucial for safeguarding cultural heritage against homogenization. |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?**  **(If not please suggest an alternative** | The title "From Local Threads to the Formation of Ilocano Identity: The Socio-Cultural  Relevance of Abel Ilocos of Vigan City" effectively captures the essence of the study. However, a  slight revision could enhance clarity and specificity. The term “Abel Ilocos” is somewhat broad  and may not fully convey the study’s specific focus on the weaving tradition rooted in Vigan.  Replacing it with “Abel Vigan” or “Panagabel” can provide a clearer geographic and cultural  context | The study adopted its recommendation. “Abel Ilocos” is replaced with “Panagabel”. |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | Yes, the abstract is overall well-structured and informative. Still, there are a few areas where  slight revisions could improve clarity and strengthen its academic tone:  • Briefly highlight the methodology – The abstract mentions participant observation and  interviews, but including a concise reference to the ethnographic nature of the fieldwork  conducted in Vigan would provide clearer insight into the research design.  • Clarify the key findings – While the description of patterns and cultural values is  informative, adding a line about how the weavers perceive their roles or how government  initiatives have impacted their craft would help ground the findings and make them more  impactful.  • Limit the list of specific patterns – Rather than detailing multiple weaving designs, it  would be more effective to highlight just one or two representative types. This keeps the  focus on the study's core message without overwhelming the reader.  • Mention the study’s broader significance – Concluding the abstract with a brief note on  how the research contributes to cultural preservation or community education would  emphasize its relevance and add depth to its purpose. | The number and nature of respondents are already included.  One sentence is rewritten to highlight the weavers' perception of their roles  The mentioned Abel patterns are already limited to only two, rather than mentioning all patterns.  A short sentence on how the research contributes to cultural preservation or community education |
| Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here. | Yes, well written | My study is grounded in ethnographic methodology and adheres to the necessary steps. |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.** | Consistency in Formatting: Ensure that all references follow a consistent citation style, including author names, publication dates, titles, and retrieval information. This uniformity enhances the professionalism and readability of your reference list. | Consistency in formatting has already improved based on the recommendation. The highlighted words and phrases are the minor chneges that are included to enhance readbility and sentence syntax. |
| Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | The language is formal and mostly consistent with scholarly writing norms. | The language used is English, and there are also direct quotations from the interviewed sources. The syntax and grammar in general are critiqued and enhanced by Language instructors. |
| Optional/General comments | Excellent Study and we'll written. | My study is grounded on ethnographic research to explore and document the narratives and has utilized appropriate sampling techniques, data gathering procedures, and other necessary processes constructively aligned with the goal of the research. |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PART 2:** | | |
|  | Reviewer’s comment | Author’s comment *(if agreed with the reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?** | *(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in detail)* | This manuscript presents work that adhered to all relevant ethical guidelines and protocols, such as proper permissions, the Data Privacy Act, and the like. |