|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | |
| Journal Name: | [**Asian Journal of Agricultural Extension, Economics & Sociology**](https://journalajaees.com/index.php/AJAEES) |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_AJAEES\_134810** |
| Title of the Manuscript: | **FROM LOCAL THREADS TO THE FORMATION OF ILOCANO IDENTITY: THE SOCIO-CULTURAL RELEVANCE OF ABEL ILOCOS OF VIGAN CITY** |
| Type of the Article | **Original Research Article** |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| PART 1: Comments | | |
|  | Reviewer’s comment **Artificial Intelligence (AI) generated or assisted review comments are strictly prohibited during peer review.** | Author’s Feedback *(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | This study significantly contributed to ethnography, cultural studies, and heritage conservation by exploring the symbolic and social significance of Ilocano weaving traditions. It underscores the understanding of how material culture shapes identity and it also reflects endangered oral histories and practices. Through rich ethnographic data and community engagement, it offers valuable insights for future research and cultural preservation efforts. | The study contributes to our understanding of human experiences, perspectives, and social dynamics that are reflected through symbolisms and material culture. This research also contributes to the development of theories that are more culturally sensitive and universally applicable, as it serves as tool for understanding the complexities of our human social life and cultural diversity. And most importantly, it contributes to the growing body of scholarship on the role of material culture in shaping social identities. My study also documents and preserves local Abel Ilocos knowledge, skills, and traditions, crucial for safeguarding cultural heritage against homogenization. |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?**  **(If not please suggest an alternative title)** | The title is suitable as it accurately reflects the study’s core focus on cultural identity and weaving in Vigan | The title highlights the Abel, Ilocano identity, and socio-cultural relevance of Abel itself. |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | The abstract is comprehensive and effectively outlines the research context, methodology, findings, and significance. However, the following suggestions may enhance its clarity:   1. Attempt shortening the sentence introducing the weaving patterns for conciseness. 2. It would be useful to briefly mention the number and nature of participants interviewed to strengthen the methodological clarity. 3. One sentence summarizing the key themes or findings from the thematic analysis would improve coherence. 4. Rearrange the keywords in alphabetical order | For conciseness, the sentence introducing the weaving patterns has already been shortened.  The number and nature of respondents are already included.  Key themes are already mentioned and given a very brief overview.  Keywords are now in alphabetical order |
| Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here. | The manuscript is scientifically apt. It adopts a well-established ethnographic methodology, supported by purposive sampling and thematic analysis. Another fascinating feat about the study is the use of direct quotes from respondents in their local language (with translations) enriches the study’s authenticity and depth. The manuscript demonstrates a rigorous ethical approach, detailed data interpretation and critical engagement with relevant literature. The methods and theoretical groundings are also tenable and apt.. | This is appreciated and noted with thanks. My study is grounded in ethnographic methodology and adhered to necessary steps. |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.** | The references are satisfactorily sufficient, recent, and relevant. The manuscript engages with both historical and contemporary sources, including government documents and academic articles from 2017 to 2024. Key areas like cultural preservation, textile studies, and ethnography are well-referenced.  However, the study can further be enriched with UNESCO documents on Intangible Cultural Heritage (for global context).  Articles on Indigenous knowledge systems or cultural resilience from broader Southeast Asian textile traditions can also enrich the study.  Other observations: Following the APA style 7th edition   * Some entries are missing authors, publication years, or publisher information. * Inconsistent date and title formatting. * Book titles should be italicized. * Journal names should be italicized, along with volume numbers.   Lastly, another observed lapse on the references, they are not in the right alphabetical order. So rearrange them. | A sentence relating to UNESCO has already been added.  A phrase on cultural resilience from broader Southeast Asian textile traditions is also added.  APA format is already followed. The references, both in-text and the latter part of the manuscript, have been improved and adhered to the format recommended, including italicization of necessary terms. Furthermore, the highlighted words and phrases are the slight changes to enhance the readability and language of the manuscript.  References are now in alphabetical order. Citations and referencing are done to ensure consistency between in-text citations and the APA reference list. Making sure those details align perfectly demonstrates attention to detail and adherence to scholarly standards. |
| Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | Yes, it is.  Minor suggestions:  A few long sentences in the introduction and abstract could be shortened for improved readability.  Ensure consistent spelling of key terms (e.g., “Panagabel” vs. panagabel) throughout. | The consistent use of terms in the discussion of results, except in actual responses of respondents, has already improved. |
| Optional/General comments | This manuscript offers a rich, well-researched contribution to cultural heritage, identity formation, and ethnographic scholarship on Ilocano weaving traditions. | My study is grounded on ethnographic research to explore and document the narratives and has utilized appropriate sampling techniques, data gathering procedures, and other necessary processes constructively aligned with the goal of the research. |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PART 2:** | | |
|  | Reviewer’s comment | Author’s comment *(if agreed with the reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?** | *(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in detail)* | This manuscript presents work that adhered to all relevant ethical guidelines and protocols, such as proper permissions, the Data Privacy Act, and the like. |