Review Form 3

| Journal Name: | International Journal of Environment and Climate Change |
|--------------------------|---|
| Manuscript Number: | Ms_IJECC_130844 |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Assessment of Heavy Metals Status in Irrigation water in the Central Narmada Valley Zone of Madhya Pradesh, India Using GIS |
| Type of the Article | |

General guidelines for the Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that <u>NO</u> manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '<u>lack of Novelty'</u>, provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guidelines for the Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

https://r1.reviewerhub.org/general-editorial-policy/

Important Policies Regarding Peer Review

Peer review Comments Approval Policy: https://r1.reviewerhub.org/peer-review-comments-approval-policy/ Benefits for Reviewers: https://r1.reviewerhub.org/benefits-for-reviewers

Created by: DR Checked by: PM Approved by: MBM Version: 3 (07-07-2024)

Review Form 3

PART 1: Comments

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's Feedback (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--|--|--|
| Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part. | The article discusses the important aspect of heavy metal contamination in the irrigation water. It provides critical data on the concentration of heavy metals and their spatial distribution. The manuscript requires slight improvements as suggested and need following two additional aspects to be discussed to make it more comprehensive and useful. 1. Discuss the spatial variability pattern observed 2. Compare water source-wise contamination levels | |
| Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title) | No. I suggest to use "Status of of Heavy Metals in Irrigation water in the Central Narmada Valley Zone of Madhya Pradesh, India" | |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | Abstract is well written. May be it requires addition of one point regarding the observed spatial distribution pattern of the heavy metal concentrations. The western areas appear to have higher contamination levels. | |
| Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here. | Yes. Authors have collected informative data on the heavy metal contamination status in the irrigation waters | |
| Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form. | | |
| Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | Language need improvement. Corrections as suggested inline may be incorporated | |
| Optional/General comments | Heavy metal concentrations in different water sources may be given. Identification of least contaminated water sources for different areas will be highly useful for the public, and can help minimize the heavy metal loads in the agricultural produces. | |

PART 2:

| | | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--|---|---|
| Are there ethical issues in this manuscript? | (If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details) | |

Reviewer Details:

| Name: | Arun, P. R |
|----------------------------------|--|
| Department, University & Country | Salim Ali Centre for Ornithology and Natural History (SACON), (South India Centre of Wildlife Institute of India, Dehradun), India |

Created by: DR Checked by: PM Approved by: MBM Version: 3 (07-07-2024)