

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Research
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJFAR_129904
Title of the Manuscript:	PROBIOTICS FOR AQUACULTURE PRODUCTION AND THE FUTURE IN THE TROPICAL ENVIRONMENT- A REVIEW
Type of the Article	

PART 1: Comments

	Reviewer’s comment	Author’s Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	Highlighting the potential of probiotics as a sustainable alternative to antibiotics in tropical aquaculture. This is crucial given the growing concerns about antibiotic resistance and the need for environmentally friendly aquaculture practices.	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	Suitable	

Review Form 3

Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	<p>The provided abstract is generally comprehensive, covering the key aspects of the review. However, some minor additions or modifications could enhance its clarity and impact:</p> <p>Additions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">*Specific Probiotic Applications: While the abstract mentions "successful aquaculture production and disease control," it could be more specific by mentioning examples of probiotic applications, such as feed supplementation, water treatment, or bioaugmentation of aquaculture systems.*Future Research Directions: Briefly mentioning potential future research areas, such as the development of novel probiotic strains, optimization of probiotic application methods, or the assessment of economic and environmental impacts of probiotic use, could further enhance the abstract's value. <p>Deletions or Modifications:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">* Minor Redundancies: The phrase "fish farming is the principal form of aquaculture" might be considered redundant.* Conciseness: While the abstract is generally concise, minor edits could improve its flow and readability.	
Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.	<p>The provided manuscript has several scientific inaccuracies and weaknesses:</p> <p>1. Inaccurate or Misleading Statements:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">* "Aquaculture is commonly referred to as fish farming because fish farming is the principal form of aquaculture..." This statement is redundant and inaccurate. Aquaculture encompasses the farming of various aquatic organisms, including fish, shellfish, crustaceans, and aquatic plants. While fish farming is a significant part of aquaculture, it is not the sole or principal form.* "The breeding, rearing and harvesting of the aquatic plants and animals take place in all types of water environment such as ponds, rivers, lakes, the ocean and man-made closed systems on the land..." This statement is overly broad. Aquaculture practices can be highly controlled and may not always involve natural water bodies.* "The use of beneficial bacterial (probiotics) which have been considered a valid alternative to prophylactic use of antibiotics for control of bacterial pathogens in aquaculture." While this is generally true, it's important to note that probiotics are not always a complete replacement for antibiotics. In some cases, antibiotics may still be necessary.* Several statements lack proper scientific support or are overly general. For example, the claim that "Lactic acid bacteria have been observed to enhance production of inhibitory substances against pathogenic organisms" needs specific citations and a more detailed explanation of the mechanisms involved. <p>2. Lack of Critical Analysis and Depth:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">* The review lacks a critical analysis of the existing literature. It primarily presents a descriptive overview of probiotic applications in aquaculture, without delving into the limitations, controversies, or areas of ongoing research.* The discussion on stress tolerance is superficial and lacks depth. It mentions general stress responses but fails to connect them specifically to probiotic mechanisms and the unique challenges faced by fish in tropical environments. <p>3. Issues with Structure and Organization:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">* The manuscript lacks a clear and concise introduction that outlines the specific objectives and scope of the review.* The flow of ideas is sometimes disjointed, and the transitions between sections could be improved.* The conclusion is brief and does not adequately summarize the key findings and their implications.	
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.	Suitable	

Review Form 3

Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	The manuscript contains grammatical errors and typos, which detract from its professionalism. * The formatting and citation style are inconsistent. Recommendations: * Thoroughly review and revise the manuscript to address the inaccuracies and improve the scientific rigor. * Strengthen the critical analysis and discussion sections. * Improve the clarity, conciseness, and flow of the writing. * Ensure proper formatting, citation style, and grammar.	
Optional/General comments	Based on the identified issues, the manuscript in its current form does not meet the standards for scientific publication. Significant revisions are needed to address the identified weaknesses and improve its overall quality.	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Masoumeh
Department, University & Country	Gorgan University of Agricultural Sciences and Natural Resources, Iran