

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Medicine and Health
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJMAH_130223
Title of the Manuscript:	Extraluminal Migration of a Catfish Bone in a 35-Year-Old Male Mimicking Neck Abscess: A Case Report
Type of the Article	Case report

PART 1: Comments

	Reviewer’s comment	Author’s Feedback(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimumof 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	This case report makes several valuable contributions to the medical literature. First, it highlights a rare but serious complication of fish bone ingestion - extraluminal migration - which is particularly relevant in regions with fish-rich diets. Second, it demonstrates the challenges of diagnosis and management in resource-limited settings where advanced imaging may not be accessible. Third, it emphasizes the importance of maintaining clinical suspicion even when initial investigations are negative, especially in cases with a clear history of foreign body ingestion.	Ok
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	The title is appropriate as it clearly indicates the key elements: the type of foreign body (catfish bone), the condition (extraluminal migration), the clinical presentation (mimicking neck abscess), and the nature of the article (case report). It also includes relevant demographic information (35-year-old male).	Noted
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	The abstract is generally comprehensive but could benefit from minor additions: 1. Include the duration between initial fish bone ingestion and presentation (2 years) 2. Mention the specific surgical approach used (neck exploration under local anesthesia) 3. Add brief details about the outcome and follow-up 4. Consider including the dimensions of the foreign body removed	Revision made
Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.	The manuscript appears scientifically sound, with: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Clear documentation of the clinical presentation• Appropriate diagnostic workup given resource constraints• Well-described surgical management• Proper follow-up care• Relevant discussion of pathophysiology and management approaches	Done
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.	: The references are generally sufficient and recent. However, I suggest adding: 1. Recent systematic reviews on fish bone foreign body management 2. References specifically about imaging modalities in foreign body detection 3. Literature on surgical approaches in neck exploration for foreign bodies	Revised as suggested

Review Form 3

Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	The English language quality is adequate for scholarly communication but would benefit from minor editing for grammar and clarity in some sections. Some sentences could be restructured for better flow.	
Optional/General comments	<div>1. Consider adding more details about the surgical procedure</div> <div>2. Include clear measurements of the extracted foreign body</div> <div>3. Add more details about post-operative care protocols</div> <div>4. Consider including a discussion about prevention strategies</div> <div>No significant ethical issues are apparent. Patient privacy appears to be maintained, though explicit mention of informed consent for case publication would be beneficial.</div> <div>The content appears original and properly referenced</div>	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with the reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?		