|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | |
| Journal Name: | [**Asian Journal of Education and Social Studies**](https://journalajess.com/index.php/AJESS) |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_AJESS\_131387** |
| Title of the Manuscript: | **Effective Pedagogical Principles in Teaching Civic Education: A Case Study of Higher Learning Institutions in Zambia** |
| Type of the Article | **Original scientific work** |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| PART 1: Comments | | |
|  | Reviewer’s comment **Artificial Intelligence (AI) generated or assisted review comments are strictly prohibited during peer review.** | Author’s Feedback *(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | **The article opens important question regarding teachers who teach civic education and think of its’ improvement. I find it very significant and would like to be publish but only when author(s) corrects mistakes I emphasized in this document.** | Thankyou |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?**  **(If not please suggest an alternative title)** | **YES** | Thankyou |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | **Here is suggestion:**  ~~This study explored the pedagogical principles employed in Civic Education instruction in selected higher learning institutions in Zambia and challenges faced by educators in employing the principles.~~ The main objective of this article was to identify the pedagogical principles employed in selected higher learning institutions and the challenges faced by educators in implementing the pedagogical principles in the selected higher learning Institutions. The study relied on Sherry Arnstein’s ladder of citizen participation model and the transformative learning theory. The study was qualitative and employed a qualitative multiple-case study design to explore pedagogical principles used at the selected higher learning institutions in Zambia. To generate data, the study used semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions from both educators and students. There is number of participants missing. | We changed the first part of the abstract to read as follows: The pedagogical principles employed in Civic Education instruction in higher learning institutions in Zambia have the potential to improve learning outcomes We changed this part as advised :this article  We added number of participants as follows:to collect data from 5 educators and 32 students. |
| Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here. | In general, it is. Here are my comments and suggestions:   1. **Abstract:** ~~This study explored the pedagogical principles employed in Civic Education instruction in selected higher learning institutions in Zambia and challenges faced by educators in employing the principles.~~ The main objective of this article was to identify the pedagogical principles employed in selected higher learning institutions and the challenges faced by educators in implementing the pedagogical principles in the selected higher learning Institutions. The study relied on Sherry Arnstein’s ladder of citizen participation model and the transformative learning theory. The study was qualitative and employed a qualitative multiple-case study design to explore pedagogical principles used at the selected higher learning institutions in Zambia. To generate data, the study used semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions from both educators and students. There is number of participants missing. 2. **Introduction:** Civic education is essential in democratic societies and is widely recognized for its basic importance in empowering students with the knowledge, skills, attitudes and values that stimulate their interest in participating in their nation's civic and political affairs (Mainde & Chola, 2020). …. development, highlighting global citizenship, human rights, gender equality, and the value of cultural diversity”. This does not belong here so I put it at other place: ~~The study’s objectives was to address~~~~the gap in the Zambian educational research thereby contributing to the international dialogue on how to promote education for democratic citizenship. This could be realized by providing~~~~information that may advance the democratic engagement of future leaders and citizens in Zambia and outside.~~ ~~The study sought to encourage participation, knowledge acquisition, and accountability of students and educators by exploring and improving the pedagogical principles of civic education within the institutions in Zambia.~~ 3. **Review of the literature:** Furthermore, other pedagogical principles ~~like~~ which include service learning projects and role play are integrated into the curriculum and employed in some institutions. 4. **Methodology:** Here is the text from Introduction: The study’s objectives was to addressthe gap in the Zambian educational research thereby contributing to the international dialogue on how to promote education for democratic citizenship. This could be realized by providinginformation that may advance the democratic engagement of future leaders and citizens in Zambia and outside. The study sought to encourage participation, knowledge acquisition, and accountability of students and educators by exploring and improving the pedagogical principles of civic education within the institutions in Zambia. This study was qualitative and used a multiple case study design. Semi-structured interviews and focus groups were the two main techniques used to collect data. Five educators from the selected universities (marked in text like L1-5) participated in 5. **Research findings:** It should be written as a new title, not subtitle. New title: **Research Findings #**   This text doesn’t belong here but in discussion. You should put it there.  ~~The study's use of the transformative learning theory shows a close observance to the theoretical foundations which emphasizes critical reflection and dialogue in reshaping students' perspectives and assumptions. These pedagogical approaches have been found to be the most successful, such as service learning and interactive teaching techniques, which involve students in real-world civic participation other than imparting academic information. By encouraging students to critically reflect on their experiences and engage in meaningful discussions, educators can help students develop a deeper understanding of civic issues and their roles as active citizens. These techniques highlight the vital role that interactive and experiential learning plays in improving civic education results by encouraging students to engage in civic life and to get a deeper understanding of the subject.~~  To enhance the effectiveness of these educational approaches, however, it was vital to overcome resource limits, curricular constraints, and ensure ongoing staff development. Where are answers from 32 students?   1. **Discussion:** Two interactive approaches that have been demonstrated to be effective in facilitating students' comprehension and engagement in civic activities are project-based learning and service learning. We can’t see it in your article. You should improve it. | We changed the first part of the abstract to read as follows: The pedagogical principles employed in Civic Education instruction in higher learning institutions in Zambia have the potential to improve learning outcomes We changed this part as advised :this article We added number of participants as follows:to collect data from 5 educators and 32 students. This part was removed and taken to the methodology section  We included selected verbatims from the students as follows: With regards to students views on the pedagogical principles employed by lecturers of civic education, the study found that following as the commonly used pedagogies in teaching civic education. One Student in FGD 1 had this to say, *“Our lecturers emphasize participatory learning. They encourage open discussions and debates on civic issues, allowing us to express our views freely”.* Another student from FGD 2 noted the use of lecture method as being common. The student remarked as follows, “*Our lecturers mostly use lecture method although sometimes they ask thought provoking questions which enable us to engage in discussions to help us understand concepts clearer*”. The other student noted group discussion as being commonly used. The student noted, *“Group discussions and presentations are common, especially when analyzing real life situations”.*  The other student from FGD 3 highlighted the use of active pedagogical methods in teaching. The student had the following to say, “*Our lecturers use interactive method, where as students we actively contribute rather than passively listen in class”.* |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.** | Yes, they are. | Thank you |
| Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | It is OK. | Thank you |
| Optional/General comments | Dear author, you opened very significant topic in your article. I fully agree it should be published, but for that reason you have to improve it. All my marks I put in the very article, so they are visible and understandable.  You completely missed to write answers of any of 32 students from your study. |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PART 2:** | | |
|  | **Reviewer’s comment** | **Author’s comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)* |
| **Are there ethical issues in this**  **manuscript?** | *(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)* |  |