

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Education and Social Studies
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJESS_130857
Title of the Manuscript:	Survey of Regulatory Landscape for School Education for Third Gender Pupils in India: With Educational Board Level Case-studies from CBSE, ICSE and UP Board
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

PART 1: Comments

	Reviewer’s comment	Author’s Feedback (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.		
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	The title is generally suitable; however, to enhance clarity, I suggest modifying it as follows: "Regulatory Landscape for Third-Gender Inclusion in Indian School Education: Case Studies from CBSE, ICSE, and UP Board"	Changed the title accordingly.
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	The abstract is comprehensive but lacks clarity on specific policy gaps and recommendations. I suggest adding: <ul style="list-style-type: none">A clearer articulation of the methodology, particularly the criteria used for selecting regulatory documents.A more precise summary of recommendations for regulatory reforms.	Added a section on methods and materials.
Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.	The manuscript is well-structured and follows a logical progression from the international to national and board-level regulatory analysis. However, some key areas require improvement: <ul style="list-style-type: none">The discussion on implementation challenges of inclusive policies at the school level is weak.More engagement with stakeholder perspectives, such as educators, school administrators, or third-gender students, would add depth.There is minimal discussion on intersectionality, particularly the role of caste, economic background, and disability in further marginalizing third-gender students.	Added these aspects in “Conclusions and outlook” chapter
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.	The references are generally sufficient and relevant. However, the manuscript relies heavily on government and institutional reports. It would benefit from incorporating: <ul style="list-style-type: none">More peer-reviewed journal articles on gender and education in India.Comparative studies from other South Asian or developing countries for broader context.Inclusion of perspectives from LGBTQ+ advocacy groups and policy think tanks.	Added these aspects in “Conclusions and outlook” chapter

Review Form 3

Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	<p>The language is generally clear and suitable for academic writing. However, some sections need refinement:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">Reducing repetition of concepts, especially in discussions on national policies.Avoiding overgeneralizations about third-gender experiences without empirical backing.Ensuring gender-neutral language throughout, particularly in areas where "boys and girls" are mentioned without acknowledging non-binary identities.	<p>The mentioning of “Boys and girls” was quotation from the reviewed policy documents. The researchers have pointed out that these policy documents should have used gender-neutral words</p>
Optional/General comments	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Ethical Considerations: Given the sensitive nature of gender identity, a discussion on ethical research approaches (e.g., confidentiality, representation) would strengthen the paper.Visual Representation: The inclusion of a table or flowchart summarizing policy gaps and recommendations would improve readability.Future Directions: The conclusion should explicitly suggest areas for future research, such as the role of teacher training and school infrastructure in fostering inclusivity.	<p>No ethical considerations in this paper because review of only (policy) documents was carried out. Ethical aspects will be considered when field studies are carried out with interviews and surveys on the topic of third-gender and education</p> <p>Comment about teacher's training and school infrastructure added in the conclusions chapter.</p>

PART 2:

	Reviewer’s comment	Author’s comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<u>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</u>	